

City of Evansville Historic Preservation Commission
Regular Meeting
Wednesday, June 18th, 2025 at 6:00 p.m.
3rd Floor City Hall, 31 S. Madison, Evansville, WI 53536

MINUTES

1. Call to Order. Lewis called the meeting to order at 6:00 pm

2. Roll Call:

Members	Present/Absent
Chair Dan Stephans	A
Vice-chair Kelly Shannon	P
Vicky Norton	P
Gene Lewis	P
Norman Barker	P
Amy Corridon	P
Steve Christens	A

Others Present

Colette Spranger, Community Development Director
Melissa Destree, Bronna Lehmann
Anne Kolasch, Beth Ammerman
Matthew Wald, Jessica Wentworth
Otto Knottnerus, Cristian Balderas
Todd Thiele, Jared Micks, Dan Riemer
Ryan Gonwa, Cassie Elmer, Don “Clay” Kohlhausen

3. Motion to approve the agenda as written by Barker, second by Corridon. Motion carried unanimously.

4. Motion to waive the reading of the minutes from the May 21st, 2025 meeting and approve them as printed. Motion by Barker, seconded by Corridon. One minor correction to be made. Motion carried unanimously.

5. Civility Reminder. Lewis noted the City’s commitment to civil discourse.

6. Citizen appearances.

7. Applications – Action Items:

A. 39 W Main – Replacement Tiles for Eager Free Public Library (HPC-2025-87)

Melissa Destree of Destree Architects appeared on behalf of the library. Hail damage [Note: a major hailstorm hit the City on April 18th, 2025] destroyed most of the tiles, which were a mixture of original tiles from 1908 and 1982. Ms. Destree is suggesting the tiles be replaced with Ludowici tiles, which are historically appropriate and very close in terms of color. Lead time on ordering is 6-9 months. The temporary roof should hold until the tiles arrive.

Motion to approve by Norton, second by Corridon. Motion carried unanimously.

B. 228 Main Street – Carport Alongside Garage (HPC-2025-31)

Applicant not present. Spranger summarized the request. Rooflines will match/compliment existing carriage house. Clarification of what structure this carport is replacing; appears to be a dog kennel or similar enclosed structure.

Motion to approve by Shannon, second by Corridon. Motion carried unanimously.

C. 345 W Liberty Street – Reroof, Replace Gutters, Replace Aluminum Siding, Replace Wood Soffit/Fascia with Aluminum (HPC-2025-32)

Clay Kohlhausen explained his request. He would like to replace his aluminum siding with vinyl, as it was damaged beyond repair in the hail storm and no match can be made. New siding will more closely match the original style of the home's siding, which was 5" lap siding. He is also restoring the porch, which is in poor shape and will be replaced with like materials. Will be using LP Smart Side for trim boards. Proposes covering original wood soffit and fascia with aluminum, which would follow contour of the existing fascia. Gutters would also be added where needed.

The Commission noted that covering wood fascia and soffit would give someone the opportunity to restore it at a later date.

The Commission debated the merits of allowing vinyl siding where it traditionally has not. A key factor they note is that no applicant was aiming to replace their siding this year, were it not for the catastrophic hail storm. They acknowledged that in most cases, the aluminum siding cannot be matched. For some, insurance companies have been difficult to work with regarding replacing all sides so that they match or even paying for a complete side of replacement materials. They would like to approve the application, requesting a smooth vinyl instead of one with an embossed wood grain pattern, that all four sides be replaced, and a note on the Certificate of Appropriateness noting that the approval was given because of hail damage out of the owner's hands.

Motion to approve by Barker, second by Norton. Condition that vinyl siding have a smooth texture and that all facades of the building have siding replaced. Motion carried unanimously.

D. 236 W Church Street - Reroof, Replace Gutters, Replace Aluminum Siding with Vinyl (HPC-2025-47)

Jessica Wentworth present and summarized request. Change in materials is due to hail damage.

Commission asks that all changes to vinyl follow the guidelines made for the previous application: all facades replaced and smooth vinyl used in place of textured.

Motion to approve by Corridon, second by Shannon. Condition that vinyl siding have a smooth texture and that all facades of the building have siding replaced. Motion carried unanimously.

E. 332 W Liberty – Reroof, Replace Aluminum Siding with Vinyl, ~~Replace Rear Windows with Same~~ (HPC-2025-79)

Beth Ammerman present and summarized request, noting that no window repair was needed, unlike what the agenda stated. Change in materials is due to hail damage. Spranger notes that all homes on the north side of the 300 block of West Liberty were built in the 1980s, well after the first survey of the historic district was completed.

Motion to approve by Norton, second by Shannon. Condition that vinyl siding have a smooth texture and that all facades of the building have siding replaced. Motion carried unanimously.

F. 203 W Main – Reroof, Replace Aluminum Siding, Replace Soffit with LP Smart Side (HPC-2025-80)

Todd Thiele of Thiele Construction represented the homeowner. Commission notes that they have not allowed original wood soffit to be removed elsewhere and would not allow it here.

Motion to approve by Shannon, second by Barker. Condition that vinyl siding have a smooth texture and that all facades of the building have siding replaced. No soffit/fascia removal permitted. Additional condition that the porch be repainted. Motion carried unanimously.

G. 18-20 Montgomery Court - Reroof, Replace Gutters and Aluminum Siding (HPC-2025-82)

Thiele represented the property owner. No questions.

Motion to approve by Barker, second by Corridon. Condition that vinyl siding have a smooth texture and that all facades of the building have siding replaced. Motion carried unanimously.

H. 53-55 N Madison - Reroof, Replace Gutters and Aluminum Siding (HPC-2025-83)

Thiele represented the property owner. Commission noted that this is very unlikely to be the original structure. No questions.

Motion to approve by Norton, second by Shannon. Condition that vinyl siding have a smooth texture and that all facades of the building have siding replaced.. Motion carried unanimously.

I. 15 Garfield Ave - Reroof, Replace Gutters and Aluminum Siding (HPC-2025-84)

Thiele represented the property owner. No questions.

Motion to approve by Corridon, second by Norton. Condition that vinyl siding have a smooth texture and that all facades of the building have siding replaced.. Motion carried unanimously.

J. 242 W Church- Reroof, Replace Gutters and Aluminum Siding, Replace Shutters with Wood (HPC-2025-85)

Dan Riemer, Ryan Gonwa, and Cassie Elmer present to summarize request. Owners are working with insurance to get all facades replaced, as there is no match for their existing ruined siding. They are working to get approval for LP Smart Side, noting that it is a product likely to stand up well to a future hail storm. Their house has more than four sides; it is important that they are able to replace all siding to provide a uniform look.

Motion to approve by Shannon, second by Barker. LP Smart siding approved if insurance will cover; vinyl siding may be used but must have a smooth texture. All facades with siding to match. Motion carried unanimously.

K. 237 W Main – Reroof, Replace Vinyl Siding with Same, Replace front and side porch, construct rear addition (HPC-2025-86)

Homeowner Jared Micks summarized his project. Originally sought to just update porches this year, but hail storm added roofing and vinyl siding replacement on the list. Front porch will be expanded to appear more like original porch, which has been replaced and changed over time. Commission wanted to know what shape and materials the columns on the porch were to be. Micks replied square, as round wooden pillars are hard to procure. Commissioners suggest a hollow, laminate pillar to maintain the characteristic shape of the porch.

Motion to approve by Corridon, second by Norton. Condition that applicant return with details for round pillars; square pillars temporarily permitted for one year. Motion carried unanimously.

8. Discussion Items

A. NAPC Exterior Materials Reading

9. Report of the Community Development Director

A. Historically Appropriate Materials Letter for Insurance Companies

B. Staff Approved Certificates of Appropriateness

- i.** 309 W Main St – Replace Siding, Re-Roof, Install Solar (HPC-2025-35)
- ii.** 262 W Church St—Re-roof (HPC-2025-36)
- iii.** 132 Garfield Ave – Re-roof, Replace Gutters (HPC-2025-37)
- iv.** 33 N Second St – Re-roof, Replace Siding (HPC-2025-38)
- v.** 339 W Liberty St – Re-roof, Replace Siding (HPC-2025-39)
- vi.** 53 N Second St– Re-roof, Replace Siding (HPC-2025-40)
- vii.** 214 W Liberty St – Re-roof (HPC-2025-41)
- viii.** 288 E Main St –Re-roof (HPC-2025-42)
- ix.** 227 W Church St –Re-roof, Replace Siding (HPC-2025-43)
- x.** 20 S First St– Re-roof (HPC-2025-45)
- xi.** 29 W Liberty St– Re-roof, Repair Siding (HPC-2025-46)
- xii.** 230 W Church St– Re-roof, Replace Siding (HPC-2025-48)
- xiii.** 245 W Church St– Re-roof (HPC-2025-49)
- xiv.** 103 S Madison St—Re-roof, re-build stairs, open porch (HPC-2025-50)
- xv.** 15 W Church St—Re-roof (HPC-51)
- xvi.** 54 N 2nd St—Re-roof, Replace vinyl siding w/Same (HPC-2025-52)
- xvii.** 129 W Church St—Re-roof, Replace vinyl siding w/Same (HPC-2025-53)
- xviii.** 38 W Church St—Re-roof (HPC-2025-54)
- xix.** 120 W Church St—Re-roof, Cedar shingles w/Same, Replace Gutters (HPC-2025-55)
- xx.** 112 Grove St—Re-roof, Window trim repair (HPC-2025-56)
- xxi.** 310 W Church St—Re-roof, Replace vinyl siding w/Same (HPC-2025-57)
- xxii.** 25 S 2nd St—Re-roof, Replace vinyl w/Same (HPC-2025-58)
- xxiii.** 131 Garfield Ave—Re-roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-59)

- xxiv. 263 W Main St—Re-roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-60)
- xxv. 12-14 E Main St—Re-roof EPDM roof (HPC-2025-61)
- xxvi. 143 W Main St—Re-roof (HPC-2025-62)
- xxvii. 42 W Church St—Re-roof (HPC-2025-63)
- xxviii. 123 S Madison St—Re-roof (HPC-2025-64)
- xxix. 104 Garfield Ave—Re-roof (HPC-2025-65)
- xxx. 133 Grove St—Re-roof, Gutters, Repair Windows (HPC-2025-66)
- xxxi. 239 W Liberty St—Re-roof, Restore wood siding (HPC-2025-67)
- xxxii. 325 W Main St—Re-roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-68)
- xxxiii. 226 W Liberty St—Re-roof, Gutters, Re-side w/Same (HPC-2025-69)
- xxxiv. 115 Garfield Ave—Re-roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-70)
- xxxv. 119 Garfield Ave—Re-roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-71)
- xxxvi. 15 W Main St—Re-room EPDM roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-72)
- xxxvii. 11-13 W Main St—Re-roof EPDM roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-73)
- xxxviii. 18 E Main St—Re-roof EPDM roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-74)
- xxxix. 7E Main St—Re-roof EPDM roof, Gutters (HPC-2025-75)
- xl. 319 W Main St—Re-roof, Re-side w/Same, Replace Backyard Shed (HPC-2025-76)

10. Correspondence, Comments and Concerns

11. Next Meeting Date: July 16, 2025 @ 6:00 p.m.

12. Motion to Adjourn by consensus.